The Perfect Storm: COVID-19
Tracing The History of Ineffective Disease Policy

Kevin T. Kavanagh, MD, MS
Health Watch USA℠
Tracing The History of Ineffective Disease Policy

• Understanding important of evidence-based strategies in the prevention of emerging epidemics.

• Understanding important of maintaining an appropriate infrastructure in the prevention of emerging epidemics.

This presentation is the express opinion of Kevin Kavanagh, not of Health Watch USA™ or the Massachusetts Nurses Association.

Source CNN: June 2020
In 2005 President George Bush stated:

- “A pandemic is a lot like a forest fire: if caught early, it might be extinguished with limited damage; if allowed to smolder undetected, it can grow to an inferno that spreads quickly beyond our ability to control it.”
- “if we wait for a pandemic to appear, it will be too late to prepare, and one day many lives could be needlessly lost because we failed to act today and one day many lives could be needlessly lost because we failed to act today.”

- A total of 7.1 Billion was requested from the U.S. Congress
- On Dec. 19, 2006, the “Pandemic and All-Hazards Preparedness Act” became law.

In December 2006, Congress passed and the President signed the Pandemic and All-Hazards Preparedness Act (PAHPA), Public Law No. 109-417, which has broad implications for the Department of Health and Human Service’s (HHS) preparedness and response activities. Among other things, the Act amended the Public Health Service Act to established within the Department a new Assistant Secretary for Preparedness and Response (ASPR); provided new authorities for a number of programs, including the advanced development and acquisitions of medical countermeasures; and called for the establishment of a quadrennial National Health Security Strategy.

The purpose of the Pandemic and All-Hazards Preparedness Act is “to improve the Nation’s public health and medical preparedness and response capabilities for emergencies, whether deliberate, accidental, or natural.”

Major Program Areas

- Biomedical Advanced Research and Development Authority (BARDA) and Medical Countermeasures;
- Emergency Support Function (ESF) #8: Public Health and Medical Response: Domestic Programs;
- Emergency Support Function (ESF) #8: Public Health and Medical Response: International Programs;
- Grants;
- At-Risk Individuals;
- National Health Security Strategy (NHSS);
- Situational Awareness: Surveillance, Credentialing, and Telehealth; and
- Education and Training

https://www.phe.gov/Preparedness/legal/pahpa/Pages/default.aspx
Face masks in national stockpile have not been substantially replenished since 2009

➢ “The Stockpile Distributed 85 Million N95 Respirators.”
➢ “But the stockpile’s reserves were not significantly restored after the 2009 (N1H1) pandemic, in the view of industry and public health experts.”
➢ “The Department of Health and Human Services said last week that the stockpile has about 12 million N95 respirators and 30 million surgical masks—a scant 1 percent of the estimated 3.5 billion masks the nation would need in a severe pandemic. Another 5 million N95 masks in the stockpile are expired.”

“But with the rise of globalization, antibiotics, antidepressants, birth control pills, blood pressure medicines, cancer drugs, among many others are made in China and sold in the United States. China's biggest impact on the US drug supply is making essential ingredients for thousands of medicines found in American homes and used in hospital intensive care units and operating rooms.”

Rosemary Gibson On Supply Chain Dependence on China: https://youtu.be/4qbxJeRSlY8

The same is true for Personal Protection Equipment, Medical Devices and Medical Supplies.
A Comment Regarding Rosemary Gibson’s Presentation:

Zaw Zaw Aung • 3 months ago

OKAY. The Chinese did not put a gun to US pharma manufacturers’ heads and say "move all your production to China". US pharma wanted 3000% margins, and also did not want to pay US workers and technicians. Believe me, none of the savings are passed on to the patient. I’ve worked in pharma in China for 20 years. We went from poorly copying drugs for our own market to being the very first place American pharma goes when they are deciding where to make a new molecule. They no longer consider US manufacturing an option.

Show less

President Trump’s Tariffs on China May Have Preemptively Helped Us Respond to Supply Chain Disruptions.
In the Spring of 2018, The Pandemic Response Team was disbanded, and their responsibilities were reassigned to other agencies

https://www.snopes.com/fact-check/trump-fire-pandemic-team/
Sept. 2018: “The lack of firm standards and policies is placing healthcare workers along with their patients and families at risk for acquisition of these dangerous pathogens. At a minimum we need routine testing to identify carriers and a standardized national reporting system for healthcare worker acquisitions, along with an economic safety net for those workers who acquire these dangerous pathogens.”


Sept 2018: **Proposed Policies to Protect Healthcare Workers:**

- The screening of patients and healthcare workers for dangerous pathogens, including MRSA, to mitigate the chances of spread to other patients, staff and the community.
- **Establish a surveillance system for healthcare workers** to determine the extent of occupational acquisition and infections of dangerous pathogens, including MRSA.
- **Establish an economic and healthcare safety net for healthcare workers who become infected or colonized with dangerous pathogens**, including MRSA.
- Research to promote effective screening and decolonization of healthcare workers for dangerous pathogens, including MRSA.

Jan. 2019: Comment on the PACCARB Key Strategies: Goal 1: Slow the emergence of resistant bacteria and prevent the spread of resistant Infections

“In the 2018 Key Strategies the only specific protocol which was mentioned for inclusion in education was hand hygiene. However, much more needs to be specified. In the context of drug resistant bacteria, hand hygiene is a backup measure, since these organisms should not be on a healthcare worker’s hands in the first place. The committee should expand its focus on prevention to include patients and healthcare workers to undergo routine active surveillance for carriage of endemic MDROs. A reporting system of healthcare workers’ carriage and infections along with an economic safety net for those affected also needs to be implemented.”

January 2019: Of particular concern are nursing homes, where the reported risk of carriage of resistant bacteria is alarming, well over 50%. And carriage in both the patient and the environment can last for months. The 2019 CDC Threat Assessment lists *Candida auris* and CRE as an urgent threat and MRSA as a severe threat. A slide from this morning’s Threat Assessment presentation stated *Candida auris* and CRE need to be contained through an “aggressive approach.” However, the current “enhanced barrier precautions” for nursing homes have lowered the standards of control for these three dangerous organisms.

I feel it is of utmost importance that we have an informed public and patients. And that we protect our healthcare workers. Finally, if we are unable or unwilling to allocate the resources to stop this epidemic, we need to at least provide informed consent to patients regarding the risks of these infections and carrier rates within facilities.


We knew this was coming.  We had so many near misses

- Ebola
- SARS
- MEARS

“An eerily prescient novel about a devastating virus that begins in Asia before going global . . . A page-turner that has the earmarks of an instant bestseller.”

—New York Post

“A compelling read up to the last sentence. Wright has come up with a story worthy of Michael Crichton. In an eerily calm, matter-of-fact way, and backed by meticulous research, he imagines what the world would actually be like in the grip of a devastating new virus.”

—Richard Preston, author of The Hot Zone

Published; April 28, 2020

The Oct. 2019 draft report of Crimson Contagion was, (NYT) “marked “not to be disclosed,” laid out in stark detail repeated cases of “confusion” in the exercise. Federal agencies jockeyed over who was in charge. State officials and hospitals struggled to figure out what kind of equipment was stockpiled or available. Cities and states went their own ways on school closings.”

Hospital beds
Total, Per 1000 inhabitants, 2018 or latest available

Source: OECD Health Statistics: Health care resources
Degraded Infectious Disease Infrastructure

Centers for Disease Control and Prevention Funding History

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fiscal Year</th>
<th>Budget Authority</th>
<th>Prevention and Public Health Fund</th>
<th>PHS Evaluation Transfer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FY 2018</td>
<td>$6,824</td>
<td>$801</td>
<td>$0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FY 2019</td>
<td>$6,478</td>
<td>$805</td>
<td>$0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FY 2020</td>
<td>$5,215</td>
<td>$423</td>
<td>$894</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The CDC’s China headcount has shrunk to around 14 staffers, down from approximately 47 people since President Donald Trump took office in January 2017, the documents show. The four people, who spoke on condition of anonymity, said the losses included epidemiologists and other health professionals.
Conflicting Information Hampered Response

From: Dr. Robert R. Redfield (CDC)
Sent: Tuesday, January 28, 2020 1:57:24 PM (UTC+00:00) Monrovia, Reykjavik
To: Dr. Robert R. Redfield (CDC)
Subject: 2019 Novel Coronavirus Outbreak Update

Dear Colleagues,

In my last staff update, I shared that CDC has activated its Emergency Operations Center (EOC) in response to the ongoing 2019 novel coronavirus outbreak (2019-nCoV), which originated in Wuhan, China. CDC, along with the US Department of Health and Human Services, has been actively monitoring the situation for several weeks and is working with the World Health Organization, state and local public health partners and clinicians to respond to this emerging public health threat.

Chinese authorities identified the new coronavirus that resulted in human infections and person-to-person spread in China, and travel-associated coronavirus infections in a growing number of other countries, including five confirmed cases in four US states as of January 28, 2020.

The discovery and outbreak of a new virus among people is always of great public health concern. While we believe the 2019-nCoV poses a very serious public health threat, the virus is not spreading in the U.S. at this time and CDC believes the immediate health risk from 2019-nCoV to the general American public is low. We do expect to find more cases of novel coronavirus in the United States associated with this outbreak and it’s likely there will be some person-to-person spread with this virus. CDC’s goal is to assure an effective response to this emerging infectious disease, and we expect this will require our concerted effort in partnership with state and local public health officials, the clinical community, and international partners.

In January 29, 2020, Peter Navarro was reported to have warned the White House that the Coronavirus was possibly infectious as the Bubonic Plague or Polio.

Should the White House Order a Travel Ban to Combat a Potential Coronavirus Pandemic?
White House Office of Trade and Manufacturing Policy
1.29.20

This historical precedent alone should be sufficient to prove the need to take aggressive action to contain the outbreak. However, current estimates suggest that risk may be even higher. The risk of a severe pandemic rises exponentially with the $R_0$ value of any disease, which measures how many new people each infected person spreads the disease to, on average. China is reporting a possible coronavirus $R_0$ of 3 to 5 – which is roughly twice as high as the Swine Flu (1.5) and Spanish Flu (2.2), and in the range of the Bubonic Plague (3.5) and Polio (3.5).

**Health experts warn China travel ban will hinder coronavirus response**

Public health experts have warned that travel bans are not effective at stemming the spread of a virus and can make responding to an outbreak more challenging.

“From a public health perspective, there is limited effectiveness. And then there are a host of other reasons why they can actually be counterproductive,” said Catherine Worsnop, who studies international cooperation during global health emergencies at the University of Maryland.


---

**Taiwan's coronavirus response is among the best globally**

Among those early decisive measures was the decision to ban travel from many parts of China, stop cruise ships docking at the island’s ports, and introduce strict punishments for anyone found breaching home quarantine orders.

Most Public Health Experts Agree the Initial Travel Ban Was Beneficial in Buying The United States Some Time to Gear Up For This Epidemic.

However, the Virus then entered the United States from Europe.

Many feel the time bought in February was Squandered.
I understand this whole situation may seem overwhelming and that disruption to everyday life may be severe. But these are things that people need to start thinking about now. I had a conversation with my family over breakfast this morning and I told my children that while I didn’t think that they were at risk right now, we as a family need to be preparing for significant disruption of our lives. You should ask your children’s school about their plans for school dismissals or school closures. If ask if there are plans for teleschool.


CDC expects ‘community spread’ of coronavirus, as top official warns disruptions could be ‘severe’

“As of March 23, more than 90 state and local public health labs in 50 states, the District of Columbia, Guam, and Puerto Rico verified they are successfully using [the] diagnostic kits,” Haynes said in the statement.

Shortcomings with the tests were first noticed in late January, after the CDC sent an initial batch to 26 public health labs across the country. According to those with knowledge of what unfolded, false-positive reactions emerged at 24 of the 26 labs that first tried out the kits in advance of analyzing samples gathered from patients.
A CDC veteran asks: Why is the agency ‘sitting on the sidelines’ in the fight against Covid-19?

By PIERRE E. ROLLIN
MARCH 26, 2020

Failure in Testing Development

**U.S. still falling short on accurate testing, FDA chief says**

Dr. Stephen Hahn says more tests are needed and that antibody tests need “to be valid and accurate and reliable.”


**CDC Says Possibly 'Less Than Half' Of Positive Antibody Tests Are Correct**

The United States Now Has 100s of Tests with very specific reagents and supply chains, making support strategically difficult at best.

[https://www.forbes.com/sites/tommybeer/2020/05/26/cdc-says-possibly-less-than-half-of-positive-antibody-tests-are-correct/#5112d8d2391b](https://www.forbes.com/sites/tommybeer/2020/05/26/cdc-says-possibly-less-than-half-of-positive-antibody-tests-are-correct/#5112d8d2391b)
“...cities in which multiple interventions were implemented at an early phase of the epidemic had peak death rates approximately 50% lower than those that did not and had less-steep epidemic curves.” Interventions included closure of schools, churches, and theaters.

In mid-April Far Right Protestors Banishing Semi-Automatic Weapons in Democratic-governed states demanding democratic reopening. President Trump tweeted his support. “LIBERATE MINNESOTA!” “LIBERATE MICHIGAN!” “LIBERATE VIRGINIA,” and save your great 2nd Amendment. It is under siege!”

Fox News, Sean Hannity March 9, “They’re scaring the living hell out of people. And I see them again as like, ‘Oh, okay, let’s bludgeon Trump with this new hoax.’”

In mid-March, the network changed its editorial narrative to take the virus seriously.

https://www.theatlantic.com/ideas/archive/2020/06/this-is-trumps-plague-now/613633/

There was a push for early reopening, without the use of masks.
Researchers: Nearly Half Of Accounts Tweeting About Coronavirus Are Likely Bots

"We do know that it looks like it's a propaganda machine, and it definitely matches the Russian and Chinese playbooks, but it would take a tremendous amount of resources to substantiate that," said Kathleen Carley, a professor of computer science at Carnegie Mellon University.

The EU document said the Russian campaign, pushing fake news online in English, Spanish, Italian, German and French, uses contradictory, confusing and malicious reports to make it harder for the EU to communicate its response to the pandemic.
False Information – Social Distancing, Stay at Home Orders & Masks are Not Needed

FALSE CORONAVIRUS INFORMATION ON SOCIAL MEDIA

- False claims that the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation created and released the virus.
- Fake news stories claiming Pope Francis tested positive for coronavirus.
- Doctored Facebook post of Mike Pence telling people to go to the police if infected.
- Articles claiming without evidence that coronavirus is a Chinese bioweapon.

#INSIDEPOLITICS

MISINFORMATION SPREADS ONLINE AMID CORONAVIRUS FEARS
False Information – COVID-19 Just Affects Large Cities Such as New York and Not Rural Areas

KENTUCKY COVID-19 CASE RATE

There are at least 10,315 cases of COVID-19 Kentucky. Here are the total reported cases per 100,000 people. LAST UPDATE: June 2, 2020

Cases per capita
- 500.0
- 1000.0
- 1500.0

Rate is calculated by 100,000 people
Map: Daniel Desrochers • Source: Gov. Andy Beshear • Get the data

From Lexington Herald Leader
Surgeon General – Do Not Wear a Mask

U.S. Surgeon General @Surgeon_General · Feb 29

Seriously people—STOP BUYING MASKS!

They are NOT effective in preventing general public from catching #Coronavirus, but if healthcare providers can’t get them to care for sick patients, it puts them and our communities at risk!

bit.ly/37Ay6Cm

April 3, 2020


Your cloth face covering may protect them. Their cloth face covering may protect you.
As Trump touts increased production, coronavirus swabs made during his Maine factory tour will be tossed in the trash

John Fritze and Michael Collins | USA TODAY

Published 5:06 p.m. ET Jun. 5, 2020 | Updated 5:31 p.m. ET Jun. 5, 2020

Workers in white lab coats, hair nets and plastic booties worked at machines making swabs while the president walked through the room. Trump, who did not wear a mask for the visit, stopped at one point to talk with some of the workers.
False Information – Masks Do Not Help & Only Advocated by Left Wing Zealots

What Republican Governors & Leaders Are Saying About the Public Wearing Masks

**THE BALTIMORE SUN**
Gov. Hogan mandates masks in stores, on transit; warns against quick end to measures to contain the coronavirus

**CNN politics**
Ohio Republican governor says wearing a mask is 'about loving your fellow human being'

**Community Impact**
Gov. Doug Ducey: ‘Every Arizonan should wear a face mask;' gives local governments ability to implement face mask policies

**CORONAVIRUS UPDATES FROM THE GOVERNOR**
Arkansas governor: Customers refusing to follow mask rules are 'very selfish'

**TIME**
North Dakota Governor Chokes Up as He Calls on State Residents to Avoid 'Mask Shaming'

**Boston Herald**
Coronavirus in Massachusetts: Charlie Baker’s mandatory face mask order could be met with frustrations
Senator McConnell: "we must have no stigma, none, about wearing masks when we leave our homes and come near other people. "Wearing simple face coverings is not about protecting ourselves, it is about protecting everyone we encounter."


Vice-President Pence: "Vice President Pence on Sunday implored Americans to wear face masks, practice social distancing and stay away from senior citizens to protect ...”

By the End of June: Fox & Friends Co-Host Steve Doocy – Encouraged the President to wear a mask.

“I think that if the president wore one, it would just set a good example. He’d be a good role model. I don’t see any downside to the president wearing a mask in public,” said “Fox & Friends” co-host Steve Doocy during an interview with Ronna McDaniel, chair of the Republican National Committee.

Doocy went on to pitch the party chief an updated play on Trump’s signature campaign slogan. “‘MAGA’ should now stand for ‘Masks Are Great Again.’ Let me give you some marketing advice right there,” he told McDaniel.

CDC urges organizers of large gatherings to “strongly encourage” use of face masks.

A similar recommendation to use cloth face coverings in settings that involve shouting, chanting, or singing, including choirs, was removed from the agency’s guidance for reopening houses of worship two weeks ago after weeks of debate between the White House and the CDC.

https://www.washingtonpost.com/health/2020/06/12/cdc-masks-protests-rallies/
Lack of Federal Coordination of Supply Chain and Personal Protective Equipment

CORONAVIRUS PANDEMIC

TRUMP: GOVERNORS SHOULD GET SUPPLIES FOR THEIR OWN STATES, FEDERAL GOVERNMENT IS "NOT A SHIPPING CLERK"

SQUARE HOSPITALITY GROUP, IS LAYING OFF ABOUT 2K WORKERS -- 80%
Hospitals say feds are seizing masks and other coronavirus supplies without a word

Hospital and clinic officials in seven states described the seizures in interviews over the past week. The Federal Emergency Management Agency is not publicly reporting the acquisitions, despite the outlay of millions of dollars of taxpayer money, nor has the administration detailed how it decides which supplies to seize and where to reroute them.

Lack of Federal Coordination of Supply Chain and Personal Protective Equipment

Feds Confiscated 3,000,000 Masks Ordered by State of MA @ The Port of NY.

As many of us have read, Robert Kraft, owner of the New England Patriots, sent his own plane to China to pick up 1.3 million masks. He also paid $2,000,000 for half the cost of the masks he had flown in on his plane.

Feds confiscated the N95 masks intended for doctors, nurses, and first responders when they arrived at the Port of NY.

DannyB. Feds Confiscated 3,000,000 Masks Ordered by State of MA @ The Port of NY. Daily Kos. April 4, 2020. 
Lack of Federal Coordination of Supply Chain and Personal Protective Equipment

Maryland governor says coronavirus tests acquired from South Korea under guard at undisclosed location

BY ZACK BUDRYK AND J. EDWARD MORENO - 04/30/20 03:22 PM EDT

Maryland @GovLarryHogan on whether he was concerned that the federal government would seize the tests the state procured from South Korea. He says the tests are being guarded by the National Guard at an undisclosed location.
youtu.be/PjkMyHbyhro

## COVID-19 Experience in US and South Korea

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>January 21</th>
<th>March 3</th>
<th>May 11</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1st confirmed case</td>
<td>9 deaths</td>
<td>81,285 deaths</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.6% unemployed</td>
<td>4.4% unemployed</td>
<td>14.7% unemployed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1st confirmed case</td>
<td>28 deaths</td>
<td>256 deaths</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4% unemployed</td>
<td>3.8% unemployed</td>
<td>4% unemployed</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Key Factors in COVID-19 Response:

- Testing
- Contact Tracing
- Social Distancing
- Healthcare Systems

Data Source -- Worldometers.info, Dorea Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Trading Economics South Korea Unemployment Rate
COVID-19: USA Falls Behind Other Countries

CORONAVIRUS DEATHS
SOUTH KOREA VS UNITED STATES

MARCH 5
35 S. KOREA DEATHS
11 U.S. DEATHS

JUNE 19
280 S. KOREA DEATHS
118,991 U.S. DEATHS

Source: Johns Hopkins University

BREAKING NEWS
U.S. CORONAVIRUS DEATH TOLL APPROACHING 119,000

Source: Johns Hopkins University

CONTAINS CLASSIFIED INFORMATION; BOLTON IS ASKING FOR CASE TO BE
SITUATION ROOM
COVID-19: New York City

Daily New Deaths in New York

Daily Deaths

Deaths per Day
Data as of 0:00 GMT+8

World O Meter: https://www.worldometers.info/coronavirus/usa/new-york/
Governor Cuomo: Mandated that our disjointed healthcare system work together.

- Share Staff
- Share Supplies
- Share Ventilators
- Some Facilities were COVID-19 Facilities

Cuomo: Hospitals cannot discharge COVID-19 patients to nursing homes

Nursing home staffers will be tested for virus twice a week

Cayla Harris
May 10, 2020 | Updated: May 10, 2020 6:57 p.m.

New coronavirus cases in the US vs. the EU

Soaring daily reported cases in the US and low EU numbers show why Americans are facing a European travel ban.

Note: Data based on rolling, seven-day averages

Last updated: June 30, 2020 at 2:30 a.m. ET
Source: Johns Hopkins University Center for Systems Science and Engineering
Graphic: Byron Manley and Henrik Pettersson, CNN


Tulsa Oklahoma Rally – June 20, 2020


Daily confirmed new cases (3-day moving average)
Outbreak evolution for the 50 STATES, D.C, AND PUERTO RICO

This page was last updated on Sunday, June 21, 2020 at 3:00 AM EDT.

https://www.washpost.com/
The Quest for a Vaccine

- World-wide, over 100 Manufacturers Developing a Vaccine.
- 10 Look Promising.
- United States starting To Manufacture While Being Tested.
- Challenge Tests May Be Used.
America is running short on masks, gowns and gloves. Again.
Health-care workers are scrambling for supplies and reusing equipment as the coronavirus pandemic surges


Trump trashes CDC school-reopening guidelines -- then CDC updates them
By Betsy Klein and Kevin Liptak, CNN
Updated 6:43 PM ET, Wed July 8, 2020

funding/index.html
IF WE DO NOT CHANGE OUR DIRECTION,

we are likely to end up where we are headed.

Ancient Chinese Proverb